

**Evaluation of the efficiency and effectiveness of the Twf Project, which encourages parents to transmit the language to their children**

Final Report  
December 2003

Professor V.K. Edwards  
Dr. L. Pritchard Newcombe

University of Reading

# Contents

Executive summary

Introduction

Data collection and analysis

Measuring impact

Transmitting the project's message

Families

Structure

Partnerships

Summary and conclusions

Recommendations

Appendix A: Fields of interest specified in tender

Appendix B: Analysis of data

Appendix C: Review of Twf promotional materials

## Executive Summary

One of the main priorities for the revitalization of the Welsh language is to increase the number of families currently transmitting the language to their children. In order to address this issue, the Welsh Language Board won funding from the National Assembly for Wales to establish a three-year project (2001/02 - 2003/04) to encourage parents to transmit the Welsh language to their children.

A team from the University of Reading led by Professor Viv Edwards was contracted to evaluate the impact, efficiency and effectiveness of the Twf project against its three strategic aims. A judgment sample of the main stakeholders in the project - managers, the Twf project officers, parents, health workers and other partners - took part in in-depth interviews. Interview data were supplemented by observation and analysis of Twf publicity materials.

Twf has been extremely successful in achieving the first of its strategic aims: bringing bilingualism into the mainstream work of midwives and health visitors. By winning the support of directors of midwifery and health visiting services in the project areas, it has been possible to gain access to, and develop good working relationships with, large numbers of health professionals. Measures are now in place to ensure that midwives discuss language choice with women during pregnancy and for health visitors to continue the discussion after birth. The project is also working with Health Professions Wales and the Welsh colleges to ensure that information on bilingualism becomes an integral part of the training of health visitors and midwives.

Twf has shown considerable imagination and resourcefulness in achieving its second strategic aim: raising awareness amongst parents, prospective parents and the public at large of the advantages of bilingualism. In shifting the focus from mixed language families to *all* families, the project has made a virtue of necessity. Very large numbers of people have been exposed to information on the benefits of bilingualism through discussions with midwives and health visitors, presentations to antenatal classes and parent groups, a Twf presence at national and local events, and Twf marketing materials. Project officers are also working effectively to provide opportunities for parents to gain confidence in using the language and to promote Welsh language provision for young children and parents through Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin, Mentrau Iaith and Welsh for Adults.

It is not feasible to measure directly the extent to which the project is achieving the third of the strategic aims: changing the language patterns of the target group, namely mixed language families, in order to increase the number of children speaking Welsh in the home. A wide range of factors influence decisions about language choice and it is impossible to isolate the influence of Twf. There is, however, no shortage of anecdotal evidence that Twf is making a valuable contribution not only to this aim, but also to the broader aim of helping all families to make an informed choice, irrespective of language background.

Twf has grown rapidly in a short period of time and has been extremely successful in transforming the abstract concept of family bilingualism

into a concrete message with which the target audience can identify. Fieldworkers are well placed to be able to identify and respond to needs as they arise. There is, however, a danger that they may be tempted to do too much, too soon, diluting the impact of their efforts in the process. The role of the Welsh Language Board in managing the project provides a useful counterbalance to this temptation.

The national and international importance of Twf should not be underestimated. While various language minority communities are addressing language transmission in the family in a piecemeal way, the Twf project represents the first serious attempt to tackle this issue on a strategic level. It will be important for the Welsh Language Board to disseminate the experience of this highly innovative project to speakers of other lesser-used languages.

# Introduction

One of the main priorities for the revitalization of the Welsh language is to increase the number of families currently transmitting the language to their children. An initial and tentative analysis of the 2001 Census suggests that only 81.9 per cent of families where both parents speak Welsh transmit the language to their children; in two adults households where only one adult is Welsh speaking, the figure falls to 39.8 per cent. In order to address this issue, the Welsh Language Board decided to target mixed-language families directly. This issue had been an area of concern for some years. During 1998/99 a pilot project was set up in Carmarthenshire in collaboration with the Mentrau Iaith (language initiatives), midwives and health visitors. Materials were produced, and Mentrau staff and health workers met parents to introduce information about the advantages of raising children bilingually. Simultaneously, information on raising children bilingually was included in the 'Bounty' packs (free samples and information leaflets distributed to all women giving birth in a hospital) in Wales.

The pilot project was evaluated, found to be effective, and the Board won additional funding from the National Assembly for Wales to establish a three-year project (2001/02 - 2003/04) to encourage parents to transmit the Welsh language to their children. The work was put out to tender and the contract to operate the project was won by Iaith Cyf.. The project was publicly launched under the name of 'Twf' in March 2002.

This report aims to evaluate the impact, efficiency and effectiveness of the Twf project against its strategic aims:

1. To bring the message of the advantages of bilingualism into the mainstream work of midwives and health visitors
2. To raise awareness amongst parents, prospective parents and the public at large of the advantages of bilingualism
3. To change the language patterns of the target group, namely mixed language families, in order to increase the number of children speaking Welsh in the home.

First, however, the findings will be presented for each of the research questions posed in the tender document (see Appendix A).

## Data collection and analysis

The University of Reading research team consisted of Professor Viv Edwards, Dr Lynda Pritchard Newcombe and Rhiannon Gomer.

It was considered that, within the constraints of a short-term evaluation, open-ended semi-structured interviews would generate richer and more reliable data than alternative approaches. We identified, in consultation with Twf project staff, a judgment sample, which included the main stakeholders. As indicated in Table 1 below, five main groups were consulted: managers; the Twf project officers; parents; health workers; and other partners.

Stakeholders	Interviewer	Language	Location	Date
Development Officer	VE	English	St. Asaph; Newcastle Emlyn	16.09.03
Chief Executive <i>laith Cyf.</i>	VE	English	Newcastle Emlyn	16.09.03
Community Projects Officer, WLB	VE	English	Cardiff	29.09.03
Chief Executive, WLB	VE	English	Cardiff	29.09.03
Project officers	LPR	Welsh	St. Asaph	11.09.03
Project officers	RG	Welsh	St. Asaph	11.09.03
Project officers	LPR	Welsh	Aberaeron	15.09.03
Project officers	RG	Welsh	Aberaeron	15.09.03
Health Visitors	LPR	Welsh	Pontyberem	16.09.03
Health Visitors	RG	English	Mancot	25.09.03
Health Visitors/ Health care assistants	RG	Welsh	Dolgellau	22.09.03
Midwives	LPR	Welsh	St. Asaph	10.09.03
Midwives	VE	English	St. Asaph	10.09.03
Midwives	LPR	Welsh	Pontyberem	16.09.03
Other Partners	VE	English	Wrexham	12.09.03
Other Partners	LPR	Welsh	Pontyberem	16.09.03
Other Partners	VE	English	Aberaeron	15.09.03
Parents	LPR	English	Mold	12.09.03
Parents	RG	Welsh	Mold	12.09.03
Parents and child minder	LPR	English	Tumble	23.09.03

**Table 1:** Interviews with stakeholders in Twf

The main disadvantage of this method was the dependence on the contacts provided by Twf workers. We stressed the importance of speaking to a range of people, including some who may have been agnostic or even hostile to the project. It was not possible, however, to ensure that the people put forward by the team would not be biased in favour of the project. That said, Twf staff behaved with great integrity. Although they made initial contact with participants, they requested that the researchers take responsibility for all further negotiations in order to stress the independence of the evaluation. In addition, in some instances, the

contact person rather than Twf workers nominated people to be interviewed. This was the case, for instance, with most of the health professionals, where line managers issued a blanket invitation to members of a team, and all those available at the appointed time took part.

Parents proved to be the most problematic group. Twf contact with parents is usually on a one-off rather than a sustained basis. Parents tend to be a transient population, with many new arrivals and departures, particularly at the beginning and end of the school year. Because fieldwork took place in September, it was impractical to approach groups that Twf had worked with in the previous year. The situation was exacerbated by the fact that we were proposing group interviews, and it was extremely difficult to arrange a convenient time and place. In the end, we used a range of opportunistic strategies: in Mold, we made use of use of the project worker's social networks to arrange interviews with two groups of parents in a chapel vestry while younger children were in school; at Llechyfedach, we were able to meet parents in the Ti a Fi group, with the assistance of a mother who had completed a Twf evaluation form. There was also opportunity for brief informal discussions with parents at a taster class in Ammanford.

Twf project officers were interviewed in groups of 4 or 5 at regional meetings in St Asaph and Aberaeron. Midwives were interviewed at St Asaph and Pontyberem; health visitors in Mancot, Dolgellau and Pontyberem. A range of other partners were consulted in Wrexham, Aberaeron and Pontyberem. Parents were interviewed in Mold and Llechyfedach. It was possible in this way to achieve good geographical coverage of North and South West Wales and also to sample Anglicized and Welsh heartland areas in both regions. The aim was to use the dynamics of the group to spark a free flow of ideas and opinions; numbers were, however, sufficiently small to ensure that all participants had a voice. For practical reasons, the interviews with managers from the Welsh Language Board and Iaith Cyf. were undertaken on a one-to-one basis.

Wherever possible, interviews were conducted in participants' language of choice. The use of group interviews, however, meant that whenever one person spoke only English it was necessary to conduct the entire interview in English. Attempts were made to address this issue by arranging some interviews for Welsh speakers only. In practice, fieldworkers needed to be flexible. On one occasion, the unexpected arrival of a monolingual English-speaker for a Welsh language interview made it necessary to switch to English; and, on another occasion, bilingual participants switched to Welsh when an English-speaking member of the group failed to show.

For purposes of respondent validation, summaries of the main points emerging from the interviews were provided for participants, who were invited to comment on matters of accuracy and interpretation. Phone, email and letters were used to handle any issues arising that required further clarification.

The research questions set out in the invitation to tender were used as the starting point for open-ended semi-structured interviews. This approach made it possible not only to cover issues identified by the Welsh Language Board but also to offer important information and insights on issues not foreseen in the original brief.

Interview data were supplemented by analysis of Twf publicity materials (see Appendix A), and observations of project staff at work in a number of settings, as set out in Table 2 below.

Event	Researcher	Location	Date
Project officers' meeting	LPR	St. Asaph	11.09.03
Project officers' meeting	LPR	Aberaeron	15.09.03
Taster class	LPR	Ammanford ' <i>Ti a Fi</i> '	18.09.03
<i>Twf</i> stall	LPR	Pencader Primary School	27.09.03

**Table 2: Observations of Twf project officers**

Data validity was ensured by the triangulation of data sources (project officers, health workers, other partners, parents, administrators and policy makers) and methods (interviews, observation and document analysis), and by respondent validation, as outlined above.

The data were coded using HyperResearch, a software package designed for qualitative analysis (see Appendix B). Issues were allowed to emerge from, rather than being imposed upon the data, allowing for a richer interpretation than might otherwise have been the case.

# Measuring impact

## How can the impact of Twf be assessed?

Different strategic aims are best assessed in different ways. It is a straightforward matter, for instance, to assess the extent to which Twf has succeeded in bringing discussion of bilingualism into the mainstream work of midwives and health visitors. In this case, factors such as the numbers of health authorities who have expressed support for the project and changes in practice are good indicators of progress.

Similarly, the extent to which Twf has increased the awareness amongst parents, prospective parents and the public at large of the advantages of bilingualism can be assessed by indicators such as the number of events at which Twf has been present or the print runs for marketing tools, such as the newsletter or other marketing material.

It was not feasible, however, to measure directly the extent to which the project is achieving the third of its strategic aims: changing language patterns, in order to increase the number of children speaking Welsh in the home. Because a wide range of factors impinge on decisions about language choice, it is impossible to isolate the influence of Twf.

Aspects of the project that can be easily measured tell us very little about the effectiveness of Twf. The fact that project officers maintain a presence at a growing number of local and national events is no guarantee, for instance, that the Twf message is being well received. It is essential therefore to take a more holistic approach in consultation with the many different stakeholders in the project - managers; Twf project officers; health workers; other partners; and parents. By tapping the perceptions and experiences of these different groups, it is possible to build up a detailed picture of the project.

A significant challenge for the long-evaluation of Twf will be to find a more satisfactory approach to gauging the impact of the project on parents. Project officers currently use questionnaires to evaluate their work. However, these are unlikely to yield reliable evidence, as, even when completed anonymously, respondents may be reluctant to answer honestly for fear of causing offence. Questionnaires are designed to give feedback on issues that service providers deem to be important, rather than allowing respondents to identify their own concerns. They also tend to be completed in rushed circumstances. Responses obtained in this way are thus unlikely to produce useful insights into ways in which the project can develop. Although the use of questionnaires represents good practice, it does not remove the need for independent evaluation of the impact of the project.

One solution would be to track the progress over time of selected families who have had contact with the project. Parents attending presentations by Twf project workers at antenatal classes, for instance, could be interviewed following the presentation and then again a year later. Issues to be explored might include: the impact of Twf and other factors on language choice; exposure to the Twf message at different points in time (e.g. at the eight month developmental check by health visitors, at mother and toddler groups and other pre-school provision); exposure to the Twf message at local

and national events, and through promotional material; and the influence of Twf and other factors on patterns of language use in the family. The findings of a longitudinal study of this kind would then feed back into Twf policy and practice. They would also intersect with the findings of other research commissioned by the Welsh Language Board.

### **What outcomes from Twf are evident?**

There have been a number of tangible outcomes: the project has established effective working relationships with a wide range of organizations and individuals; project workers have successfully targeted a much wider audience than has traditionally been the case for Welsh language organizations; and fieldwork has made it possible to identify and respond to previously unidentified needs.

#### *Working relationships*

By working strategically with regional directors of midwifery and health visiting services, it has been possible to gain access to local clinics, and there is evidence that Twf workers have developed good working relationships with large numbers of health professionals. In spite of pressures of work, most midwives and health visitors take seriously their responsibility for discussing language choice with mothers. Strong links have also been forged with a range of Welsh language and other Early Years organizations.

#### *Extending the audience*

Both the Welsh Language Board and Iaith Cyf. recognise that efforts to promote bilingualism have traditionally appealed mainly to middle class parents. For instance, the video produced by the Welsh Language Board and used widely in the early stages of the project featured only middle class, two parent families. Similarly, while Welsh Language Board literature on bilingualism is highly informative, the text is dense, with few illustrations, and may well be off-putting for less confident parents. Another example of this middle class bias concerns access to Welsh-medium education. In many areas, the location of schools means that bilingual education is not a realistic option for low-income families without a car.

The Twf project, in contrast, has deliberately set out to be socially inclusive. One indicator of this commitment is the attempt to establish links with organizations such as SureStart, which target low-income families; another is the Twf presence at a range of national and local events, which reach a far wider audience than has traditionally been the case. The Twf stall and activities at events such as the National Eisteddfod, the Urdd Eisteddfod and the National Agricultural Show were singled out for praise by many different stakeholders. The involvement of Welsh language TV personalities such as Martyn Geraint and *Planed Plant* proved especially popular.

Certain objective indicators also suggest that Twf is making an impact. Several project officers volunteered that they are now increasingly approached to make presentations by other partners, rather than having to initiate all contacts themselves. In addition, public awareness of the project was growing:

Dwi'n meddwl, fod pobol yn gwybod am y cynllun bellach. A cymryd enghraifft mewn sioe yn yr haf fod bobol yn dod i'r babell yn disgwyl cael gwybodaeth am ddysgu Cymraeg.  
*[I think people know about the project now. Take, for example, in shows in the summer. People come to the tent expecting to obtain information about learning Welsh.]*

Mewn sioe neu steddfod pan fydd rhywun yn siarad hefo chi wrth basio'r stondin, y 'chat-up line' oedd 'Ydych chi wedi clywed am Twf?' ac eleni mae'r mwyafrif ohonyn nhw'n dweud: 'Do, dwi wedi gweld hwnna o'r blaen'.  
*[In a show or an Eisteddfod when someone would speak to you on passing the stand, the chat up line used to be: 'Have you heard of Twf?' and this year the majority of them said, 'Yes, I have seen this before.']*

The growth in the circulation of Twf marketing materials, such as the newsletter, and the popularity of resources, such as the CD, also attest to the success of the project in reaching a very large audience.

Local activities attracted positive comment, too. These have included fun evenings for the whole family in Angelsey, where parents were given the opportunity to learn some Welsh; visits to children's libraries with *Smot* in order to stimulate interest in books in Welsh; and colouring competitions promoting the project, sponsored by the local branches of McDonalds in Newtown, Pembroke Dock, Haverfordwest, Aberystwyth and Carmarthen. Project officers were reflective and showed evidence of learning from experience. For instance, when the McDonalds promotion did not attract a large number of entries, it was decided to supply colouring pencils for future competitions so that the children could complete the activity on the spot. Disappointment about the low response rate was tempered by the realization that, even if children did not enter the competition, large numbers of parents had been exposed to the Twf message.

Our observation confirmed that Twf activities were very popular. Children at the Twf stall at a special event at the primary school in Pencader clearly enjoyed colouring the characters in the Twf colouring book and other activities. One project officer spoke to parents while the other worked with the children. Whereas project staff usually have contact only with the mother, such events have the advantage of reaching fathers and members of the extended family. As classes for adults learning Welsh are held at the school, it was also possible to link the Twf message with the opportunity to learn the language.

#### *Identifying and responding to needs*

Twf has responded flexibly to needs as they have arisen. One example concerns the lack of language learning provision specifically for mothers with young children. Although there is a range of learning opportunities for adults, most fail to meet the requirements of this important group. The timing of classes is problematic for many families with babies and pre-school children, as is the lack of crèche facilities. Equally important, some mothers reported that they lacked confidence in their ability to learn the language and would therefore be unlikely to seek out conventional classes.

Twf workers have identified this need and responded with a taster course consisting of six classes which by-pass the limitations of traditional provision. The classes take place during the day, when older children are in school or nursery; babies and toddlers remain with their mothers. In a taster class observed in Ammanford, great skill and tact were displayed as the tutor sought to convey simple Welsh phrases to parents and young children amidst considerable activity. Project officers believe that this informality is very helpful for mothers who lack confidence. Several of the parents interviewed following the class confirmed that this was indeed the case, explaining that the relaxed atmosphere helped reduce their anxiety.

The class we observed was well prepared and skillfully delivered. Queries from parents were dealt with in a positive, encouraging fashion. A particular feature of the taster course is that lesson plans are tailored to the vocabulary needs of young children. Mothers are encouraged to practise with their children, receive immediate feedback and are able to see that there are many opportunities to use what they are learning in daily life. The lessons are intended as a springboard for further Welsh learning and at least some of those attending reported that they now had the confidence to move on to evening classes. The fact that project officers are receiving growing numbers of requests to provide further courses from parents and Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin (MYM) officers suggests that they are meeting a previously unfulfilled need.

Some concern was expressed by the Welsh Language Board as to whether the classes are taking up a disproportionate amount of project officer time, and whether responsibility for language teaching should more properly reside with a body such as Welsh for Adults (WfA) through ELWa. Our own view is that Twf officers have identified and responded to this need with sensitivity and imagination. Because they enjoy the confidence of organizations such as MYM and are becoming well known in the community, they are extremely well placed to deliver the classes. There is, however, a case for exploring whether this aspect of their work can be funded from other sources.

Another example of a Twf response to perceived needs concerns the assessment of the language development of Welsh-speaking children. Monolingual English-speaking health visitors have to rely solely on the parents' comments about their children's progress. Parents' ability - or willingness - to identify a problem is, however, variable. Twf has responded by producing a booklet with vocabulary for use with three year olds. The booklet has been well received by English-speaking health visitors working in Welsh-speaking areas.

### **What is the geographical spread in impact?**

Census statistics suggest that language transmission is stronger in North West Wales than in the West. There is, however, considerable variation within areas. Project staff reported, for instance that, in North West Wales, Menai Bridge, a traditionally Welsh-speaking area, has recently become far more like the Anglicised areas of Benllech and Amlwch. Areas such as Bala, in contrast, have a very Welsh ambience; educational provision is mainly through Welsh and in-migrants need to seriously consider learning the language. Areas in and around Llanelli and Swansea in South West Wales are highly Anglicised while the nearby Gwendraeth Valley remains a Welsh stronghold. Similarly in

North East Wales, while areas such as Denbigh and the border areas of Flintshire are Anglicised, Ruthin has many Welsh-speakers.

The nature of Twf work thus varies from one location to the next, both within and between counties. It is important therefore to be able to present the benefits of bilingualism in a way which is sensitive to particular audiences - for instance, mainly English-speaking parents living in or near border areas, or parents in Welsh heartlands who have lost confidence in their ability to speak the language - as well as to mixed audiences with a wide range of needs. The structure and the management of Twf, with its network of project officers working at local level but organised in regional teams, have allowed the project to achieve good coverage of large geographical areas. The gradual expansion of the project has made it possible to develop approaches and procedures in one setting, which can immediately be applied in new settings. The opportunity to pool ideas and experience at regional and local meetings has also proved invaluable in helping develop a range of appropriate strategies for different settings. As one of the project officers explained: 'Things that work in the North, we try in the South. Everyone has ideas and we need to share these experiences. We take other ideas on board and see that they can work for us'.

Awareness of Twf is likely to be in direct proportion to the number of project workers and the length they have been working in a given area. The fact that one full-time and one part-time worker and the team leader in South West Wales are based in Carmarthenshire not only reflects the strategic importance of this area for language revitalization but also makes it possible to ensure a high profile presence for the project in the county. Density of population is another factor which will need to be considered as the project expands to South East Wales; it will clearly not be possible to achieve the same impact with the same level of staffing in a county such as Mid-Glamorgan as in a county such as Powys.

## Families

**What evidence exists as to the Project's outcomes in families?  
Is there evidence of more families using Welsh as a result of the Twf project?**

For reasons already indicated, the evidence that more families are using Welsh as a result of exposure to Twf is mainly anecdotal. Parents, health professionals and other partners were all able to cite individual cases of a change in language behaviour following exposure to the project. These included Welsh-speakers who had been using English with their children switching to Welsh; parents who had used English with their older children deciding to use Welsh with new additions; and older family members who had not used Welsh with their own children making a conscious decision to use Welsh with their grandchildren.

It is, of course, impossible to say to what extent other factors have played a part in this process. However, interviews with parents who had already tentatively decided to transmit the language confirmed that the Twf message had offered valuable reassurance. There were also indications of a snowball effect. One mother reported using what she had learned about the benefits of bilingualism from the Twf project Officer to convince English-speaking grandparents that bilingual education was a good option for her child. On another occasion, Twf literature shared with parents by a child minder was, in turn, passed on to other families, and so on.

Project officers reported that they regularly encountered sceptics. Most people were, however, dubious of the usefulness of bilingualism rather than actively opposed. There was evidence that the project team has developed good strategies for dealing with such attitudes. They were able to cite cases of parents and professionals who had been won over by their arguments, some of whom had gone on to become Welsh language learners. Even those who were negative initially tended to become reflective when presented with the evidence from the research on bilingualism. Fieldworkers see their job as helping parents to make an informed choice and recognize that undue pressure can be counterproductive. Project staff are clearly striking an appropriate balance. Although reference was made in some interviews to the overzealous efforts of campaigners for the Welsh language, no criticism of this kind was directed at the Twf team. The following exchange between two mothers in North East Wales was typical of the comments offered on this topic:

B: Beth dwi'n feddwl sydd mor dda am y peth ydy eu bod nhw'n pwysleisio dwyieithrwydd yn hytrach na Chymraeg.  
*[What I think is so good about the thing is that they emphasise bilingualism rather than Welsh]*

P: Dwi'n meddwl fod hwnna'n bwynt da, achos dydy o ddim yn torri neb allan, chwaith - gweld ei fod i gyd yn adeiladu dwyieithrwydd yn hytrach na dysgu Cymraeg.  
*[I think that's a good point because it isn't cutting anyone out either - seeing that the joint aim is building bilingualism rather than learning Welsh.]*

**What types of families are most accessed (e.g. two parents speaking Welsh; mixed language families)**

It was originally envisaged that the main audience would be families where only one parent spoke Welsh. It became apparent at an early stage, however, that it was difficult, if not impossible, to specifically target mixed language families. In simple terms, they do not exist as a separate entity.

There has been a growing awareness that the Twf message is of potential value to *all* families, irrespective of language background. Project staff and representatives of Welsh language organizations observed that it is sometimes easier for families with no Welsh to embrace the notion of bilingualism, and that many in-migrants are eager to learn Welsh and to take advantage of bilingual education. Twf not only offers information on the cultural and economic benefits of being able to speak Welsh, and also on sources of support, and there was evidence that many English-speaking parents respond favourably to this message. Michelle, a parent from North East Wales, for instance, explained:

It's made me a lot more confident that I will be able to handle Rachel being bilingual whereas it's quite frightening thinking of them going to school and learning in Welsh and not being able to help them. I feel that if there is a good support network behind me then it will help no end for me to go through the system and not feel like I'm not a part because I am not a natural Welsh speaker.

Others also commented on the effectiveness of the project in working with English speakers, including a health worker in a heartland area of West Wales:

Parents, especially [those] who are from England and who come here, they feel quite anxious that the kids will be coming back with home work and they won't know what to do and so the [Twf] packs have attempted to address that, to give them that reassurance, saying you can still speak English when the kids are Welsh speaking and still help them with the homework.

The situation for families where both parents speak Welsh is more complex. In the case of parents who are hesitating as to whether to make Welsh the language of the home, the Twf message has the same potential value as for English-speaking and mixed language families. And, in the case of parents who are already using Welsh, information on bilingualism reinforces their decision to use the language and potentially empowers them to share this knowledge with incomers, friends and neighbours. Again, there was evidence that Welsh-speaking families were responding positively to the Twf message. A mother from Flintshire explained:

Rydyn ni wedi gweld Twf yn y gwahanol wyliau sydd wedi bod yn ddiweddar - Gwyl Sir Fflint - roedd gan Twf babell, ac mae'n braf cael pethau felly, wir, er mwyn dangos fod y Gymraeg o gwmpas. Er fod yr wyl yn reit Gymreigaidd, roedd hi'n neis eu bod nhw yna, er mwyn croesawu'r di-Gymraeg, a dangos ei fod yn beth da i ddysgu'r Gymraeg.

*[We have seen Twf in the different festivals that there have been lately - the Flint festival - there was a Twf tent, and it is good to have things like that, really in order to demonstrate that there is Welsh about. Even though the festival was very Welsh it was nice that they were there to welcome the non-Welsh and show that it is a good thing to learn Welsh.]*

The Twf message has particular resonance in former heartlands areas where there has been serious erosion of the language in the last generation. Here many parents have an excellent passive understanding of Welsh but often lack the confidence to use the language with their children. A project officer reported an encounter with one such parent:

*Ges i un [fam] yn B. mewn rhyw gyfarfod, ryw Diwrnod Hwyl ac roedd hi'n siarad Cymraeg ac yn trosi i'r Saesneg gyda'i hogan fach dyflwydd. Roeddwn i wedi bod yn siarad hefo nhw mewn Cylch Ti a Fi cynt, a dyma fi'n dweud "Ti'n gwneud hynny'n dda" "Ydw achos dwi'n wedi gwybod beth ydy e fy hun, dydw i ddim eisiau hon fynd drwy run peth a es i drwyddo fe," meddai.*  
[I had one [mother] in B. in a meeting and she was switching between Welsh and and English with the little girl, two years old. I had been speaking to them in the Mother and Toddler group previously and I said: "You are doing that well." And she said: "Yes, because I know what it is like myself. I do not want this one to go through what I went through," she said.]

Twf clearly has a vital role to play in supporting families of this kind who would otherwise be daunted by the enormity of the task that was facing them.

## Transmitting the Project's message

### Are the means of introducing the Project's message to parents effective?

The Twf message is introduced to parents directly through presentations and personal contact at various parents' events, and through the presence of project officers at various national and local events, where they offer information and organize activities for parents and children. Parents spontaneously reported that project workers presented information a positive and cheerful way, which gives the impression that learning Welsh is fun. Early Years workers confirmed this was the case:

G: Roedd y stondin [Twf] yn Steddfod yr Urdd - oedd hi'n llawn bobl, a plant yn chwarae a rhywun yn canu ac yn dawnsio a cerddoriaeth. Odd hi llawn sbri.

*The [Twf] stand at Urdd Eisteddfod was full of people, children playing, someone singing and dancing and music. It was really lively.*

J: Oedd, oedd hi yn llawn bwrlwm a sbri.  
*[Yes, it was, really exciting and lively.]*

The message is communicated indirectly through project literature and other materials that are distributed by parents' groups, libraries and other information providers. There are strong indications that the materials are effective. As one mother put it: 'The resources are lovely, the standards are lovely and the songs and things, it's nice to have them'. A MYM worker made a similar point: 'Mae pecynnau Twf jyst yn, does dim byd fel yna gyda un prosiect arall'. *[Twf's packages are just great. There's nothing like them with any other project.]*

Twf has a strong brand image: its logo, strap line and distinctive characters are instantly recognizable. Its materials are accessible, authoritative and sensitive to the needs and interests of its target audience. The leaflet entitled '6Good Reasons' is the cornerstone of the Twf marketing effort. An earlier version featuring ten advantages of bilingualism was rewritten with a sharper focus to ensure that the message came across more clearly. This brightly coloured leaflet, with its distinctive square shape and minimal text, is the centerpiece of Twf marketing. It reaches very large numbers of women through records of pregnancy and Bounty packs; it is also widely distributed at events, through libraries and children's information bureaux and in response to initial inquiries.

The *6 GoodReasons* leaflet is also available in poster form to be displayed in health centres, libraries and other public places. The fact that the Twf poster was observed in the doctor's surgery on the TV Welsh language soap, *Pobl y Cwm*, is an indication of the extent of market penetration!

The *6 GoodQuestions* leaflet was designed as a follow-up to the *6 Good Reasons booklet*, for parents and others requesting further information. It is to be particularly commended for its sensitivity to the different needs of Welsh and English-speaking parents. The two language

versions of the text are not a simple translation; rather they address the specific concerns of the two language communities.

A review of the main marketing materials undertaken by Professor Sue Walker of the Department of Typography & Graphic Communication at the University of Reading (see Appendix C) confirmed the impressions gleaned from interviews that the Twf material has a clear and strong brand identity and a friendly and welcoming approach. The material was considered to be grounded in reality, embodying a genuine awareness of the needs of the communities it serves. The organization comes across as authoritative and the materials appear professionally presented.

The logo, strap line and distinctive characters which first appeared on the poster and the *6 Good Reasons* booklet as part of the Twf branding are now being exploited to considerable effect. The logo appears on all Twf material; the characters are featured in the colouring book, on t-shirts, in the Twf colouring competition and in the large plywood models used in Twf stalls and events. There is also potential to develop their use still further, for instance in children's picture books carrying the Twf message.

Another very important marketing tool is the Twf newsletter which features stories of families - including celebrities such as Huw Edwards - who have successfully brought up their children to be bilingual. Project officers identify suitable families; an outside company arranges interviews and writes up the case studies. The idea is to provide role models who can offer practical advice and reassurance that it is possible to transmit the language, even in situations that are far from ideal. Project workers are responsible for distribution to parent and toddler groups, health centres, hospitals and maternity wards.

The newsletter has proved extremely popular and is another example of how Twf workers have been able to transform the abstract notion of family bilingualism into a concrete message that the target audience can identify with. A print run for the first issue of 20,000 was increased to 40,000 for the second and third issues. Building on this success, the intention is to produce two new issues each year. Interviews with parents, health professionals and other partners confirmed that the newsletter is well received.

#### **Is there a sufficient and effective range of materials in various media, and are they utilised effectively?**

Twf has branched out from information to other kinds of materials, aimed to help parents to use Welsh with their children, including a CD and a bilingual colouring and activity book. There was almost universal praise for the CD. Parents were extremely enthusiastic; health professionals and other partners, for their part, welcomed the opportunity to hand out a learning resource, which was so popular with recipients. A MYM worker in a Welsh heartland area summed up its usefulness:

*Y peth arall da yw'r CD yma. Mae lot o gylchoedd ble mae'r rhieni yn defnyddio'r CD i chwarae yn ystod y cyfnod lle mae'r plant yn tawelu lawr neu ar y diwedd wrth fod y plant yn gwisgo cotiau neu amser paned o de. Mae lot o'r rhieni wedi hoffi'r CD ac wedi teimlo ei fod yn rhwydd iawn ei ddefnyddio.*

[The other good thing is this CD. There are a lot of situations in which the parents use the CD to play during the time when the children are settling down or at the end of the group when children are putting their coats on or having tea. Lots of parents have liked the CD and found it easy to use.]

The colouring book has also been successful and has provided a useful activity for event days. Children have something to take home with them; parents are reminded of the Twf message.

### **What forms of marketing would be suitable to transmit the Project's message?**

There was no shortage of ideas, but little overall agreement, about the form which future marketing developments might take. One of the suggestions offered by midwives was that it would be useful to play a video in waiting rooms at antenatal clinics. The Welsh Language Board and Iait Cyf. were less enthusiastic. Objections raised included the importance of having someone on hand to answer any questions; the fact that videos date very rapidly; and the desirability of using more up-to-date media, such as DVD.

Project officers were enthusiastic about the potential of a Playbus for achieving great visibility and providing a range of fun activities for parents and children. The fact that materials and equipment would be stored ready for use in the Playbus would also increase the efficiency of workers, who currently spend a great deal of time and effort storing, gathering, transporting and setting out what they need for events and presentations.

Iait Cyf. favoured using television advertising to promote the Twf message. The Welsh Language Board raised concerns about cost effectiveness and the challenges of transforming a relatively intangible product - the notion of raising children bilingually - into an effective TV commercial. If this route is pursued, they favour presenting Twf within the wider context of other Board activities - advertisements for bilingualism in children, in young people and in the workplace - rather than as a stand alone for raising children bilingually.

Twf efforts to publicize the project have become more sophisticated over time. The Welsh Language Board assists in advertising national events and is currently exploring commercial sponsorship for marketing projects. Project staff have now established a good rapport with local newspapers and Twf events are receiving good coverage.

The high profile of the Twf project has the potential to enhance public perceptions of other areas of Welsh Language Board activity. There therefore needs to be a clear articulation between marketing strategies for the project and the parent body.

## Structure

### **Is the current management structure suitable?**

The structure of the Twf project is complex. The Welsh Language Board is responsible for managing and administering the project, including an overview of the field work by Iaith Cyf.; for developing suitable materials in conjunction with Iaith Cyf.; and for sharing information and marketing the project and its aims in conjunction with Iaith Cyf.. It also has responsibility for European contacts, political development and contacts.

There are two main forms of liaison between the organizations. Most day-to-day contact involves Elaine Davies, the Twf Development Officer, on behalf of Iaith Cyf. and Bethan Roberts, the Community Projects Officer at the Welsh Language Board. A working group consisting of Elaine Davies, Gareth Iwan, the Chief Executive of Iaith Cyf., Bethan Roberts and Meirion Prys Jones, Chief Executive of the Welsh Language Board, is convened prior to the quarterly meetings of a steering committee.

The steering committee comprises representatives of Welsh language organizations and public bodies in Wales. It has, however, been difficult to ensure representation from the health professions. One strategy proposed for addressing this weakness is to organize meetings around particular themes, since it may prove easier to attract health professionals for one-off attendances than for longer-term membership of the group. It is to be hoped, however, that as the work with Health Professions Wales and the various colleges proceeds, it will be possible to identify individuals prepared to participate on a more sustained basis.

In a project with so many tiers of accountability, it is perhaps unsurprising that there should have been some initial tension between the Welsh Language Board and Iaith Cyf., an issue that was raised in the first evaluation. The Welsh Language Board clearly needs to monitor the progress of this high profile project with great care but admits that, on occasions, its interventions may have seemed heavy handed. Iaith Cyf., for its part, has not always succeeded in clearly communicating developments and intentions. Both Iaith Cyf. and the Welsh Language Board, however, reported that there had been a marked reduction in these tensions in the second year of operation, as stronger working relationships have been established.

### **Does the current line management structure ensure a full overview of the work, and its quality in particular?**

Iaith Cyf. undertakes the fieldwork. The main involvement of the chief executive, Gareth Iwan, is at a strategic level while Elaine Davies, the Development Officer, manages the project on a day-to-day basis. The increased budget awarded to the Welsh Language Board by the National Assembly for Wales for the 2003/04 financial year was reflected, in accordance with its priorities, in a higher level of funding for Twf. The Twf team grew from nine project workers at the outset of the project in March 2002 to 19 in September 2003. During that time, another tier

of management has been added with the appointment of team leaders with responsibility for North Wales and South West Wales. The Development Officer is responsible for the project officers appointed to work in South East Wales in September 2003 (and who fall outside the remit of this evaluation). The regional teams meet every three months as separate groups; there is also a national meeting every term.

Management within Iaith Cyf. is highly effective. The Development Officer feels well supported by the Chief Executive, who takes responsibility for the financial aspects of the project, influences policy and serves as a sounding board for new ideas and possible solutions to problems as they arise. The Development Officer enjoys the respect of both the Chief Executive and the project workers. She is considered approachable, efficient and encouraging, and inspires considerable loyalty and respect.

One of the most impressive achievements of the project has been the development of a highly cohesive and effective team. Project officers come from a range of backgrounds in health and education. They therefore bring many useful talents and skills to the project; they also have access to a wide variety of professional and parent networks. Observation of the regional meetings in North and South Wales indicated that the project officers were reflective, innovative and proactive, constantly seeking new ways of transmitting the Twf message. The officers are clearly committed and enjoy the work of Twf; they also feel well supported. One project officer explained: 'The fact that we work together as a team and everyone is willing to share ideas makes a big difference. It is almost like a family'. Another commented in equally enthusiastic terms: 'It is a privilege to do this job.'

As the project budget has increased, so, too, have both staff numbers and the hours that they work. The majority, however, are part-time. In general, fieldworkers who work above the statutory employment threshold are employed by Iaith Cyf. Those who work less hours and less frequently are contracted on a self-employed basis. All, bar one, are part-time contracts. Project officers are, for the most part, mothers who have recently returned to work and enjoy the flexibility offered by part-time work. Nonetheless, there are disadvantages. It is difficult, for instance, to restrict the time spent on the project to a set number of hours, and time management is an issue which has been addressed in staff training.

Iaith Cyf. takes professional development seriously and a personal budget is allocated to each member of staff. Opportunities available to all team members have included input from specialists on aspects of bilingualism and training in ICT. Advanced Welsh language skills workshops are to be offered to staff in 2004 with follow up e-mail support. Team leaders are to receive training on team management and staff support. Opportunities for training at a local level are offered when they arise. Informal training in team and national meetings also contributes to professional development, allowing staff to explore and evaluate their work and build on existing skills. Officers reported that meeting as a group with Elaine Davies was essential to their progress in the work.

## Finance

### **Is the current level of funding cost effective?**

Twf structure, management and ways of working have made it possible to achieve sound coverage of large geographical areas and to reach a very large audience of parents and prospective parents. The main investment in the project is in human resources; the output of the project is therefore directly proportional to the number of workers. Twf has grown rapidly within the space of two years from a concept to something approaching a national institution. Given its ambitious aims and its substantial achievements, the inescapable conclusion is that the current level of funding is extremely cost-effective.

### **Are the current salary levels suitable for the Project's officers and do they reflect skills and expertise?**

It is difficult to assess the appropriateness of salary levels. The skills involved in project work are very variable. Some aspects are largely manual and involve packing materials into boxes and transporting them to events or organizations involved in distribution. Other aspects are highly skilled: project officers are, for instance, required to make presentations on aspects of bilingualism to health professionals and to plan and deliver taster courses for parents. Self-employed officers are currently paid an hourly rate of £10.50, which corresponds *pro rata* to an annual salary of £15,750 plus expenses. Employees are paid on a scale from £14,649 - £18,752. These rates compare well with those of nursery nurses and classroom assistants (salary range £9,000-£15,000) but poorly with those of teachers (£15,200 - £23,300) and midwives and health visitors (£17,105 - £29,065).

Project officers' previous experience and qualifications are clearly relevant to this question. The present team includes two midwives, a midwifery assistant, a nurse, three teachers, a classroom assistant, three higher education lecturers, two youth workers, three women with substantial voluntary sector experience and one with a background in administration. Given the skills which project officers bring and the demanding nature of some aspects of their work, there is a strong argument for rates of pay to be brought more closely into line with those of health professionals and teachers.

## Partnerships: Health Sector

### Are the professional health workers effectively transmitting the Project's message?

Twf has worked strategically and to great effect with the health sector. By winning the support of directors of midwifery and health visiting services, project staff have gained access to clinics and individual health visitors and midwives. Stickers with two key questions - *Which language/s do you intend introducing to your baby?* and *Have you received information about bilingualism from your midwife?* - are routinely placed in the records of pregnancy which women carry with them, and serve as a reminder to midwives to discuss language use at an early stage. Heads of midwifery in each of the health trusts have agreed to incorporate these questions when records are next reprinted. The appointment of Gwenan Thomas to work with Health Professions Wales and other key institutions, and to provide seminars on the advantages of bilingualism for Welsh colleges attests to sound strategic planning. Considerable progress has thus been towards ensuring that information on bilingualism becomes an integral part of the training of health visitors and midwives.

Collaboration between project officers and individual midwives takes many forms. Choice of language is now routinely discussed with the mother during pregnancy in areas where the project operates. Twf project officers are also often invited to contribute to antenatal classes. Health visitors take over from midwives soon after birth. Their work is even more relevant to the project, since child development is central to their interests. Language issues often arise in conversation with parents and particularly at the eight-month assessment. A health visitor from Flintshire explained the importance of offering information on bilingualism and bilingual education at this point:

At the eight-month check there is an awful lot of information to convey to parents, and they might come with other problems. But it is also the time when they might start thinking about things like toddler groups, and looking about locally for groups that are available; so it is, I suppose, a useful time to give [information], because the next formal check we have is at two years, and by that time, some children are already attending groups.

Most health workers are supportive, enjoy good working relationships with project staff, and take the issue of bilingualism seriously. The Twf message is, however, in competition with many other demands on time and the promotion of bilingualism is inevitably a relatively low priority. A Denbighshire midwife explained that, for a variety of reasons, the number of antenatal classes sometimes has to be reduced from the full course of six. On these occasions, the Twf presentation cannot compete with more pressing medical issues and is usually dropped. A health visitor from Dolgellau also spoke of the pressures on time. She admitted: *'Dydy pob ymwelydd iechyd ddim yn ei roi yn y nodiadau - yn ei weld fel 'extra work'.* [*Not every health visitor puts it in the notes - they see it as extra work*] However, this attitude was not typical.

Some health workers, then, are clearly more committed than others to the Twf message; and views on the importance of bilingualism for their work are inevitably influenced by their own personal situation. Interestingly, language background is not necessarily an accurate predictor of attitude. Some Welsh speakers are complacent about bilingualism and the need to transmit the language; in contrast, some English speakers are very supportive. A monolingual English-speaking midwife, for instance, felt that her own experience of bringing up children bilingually in a mixed language family was invaluable in discussions with mothers. Similarly, an African health visitor working in a strongly Welsh speaking area was so aware of the importance of bilingualism that she had taken steps to learn the language. However, project workers also reported that they encountered some scepticism from health professionals; the views expressed by one of the health visitors we interviewed added weight to this observation.

Given the constraints on the time of both health visitors and midwives, the attitudes of managers may well influence the importance that they attach to cooperation with Twf. The health professionals interviewed as part of the evaluation indicated that their line managers were either supportive or neutral; no one was aware of any opposition.

#### **What further support or resources are needed by the health sector workers, if at all?**

When asked to suggest ways in which further support or resources might help them in their work with Twf, midwives and health visitors tended to focus on small improvements to the materials. There was no evidence that health workers, as a group, had identified specific forms of support or resources that would help them in transmitting the Twf message.

The most important contribution of the project will, arguably, be to ensure that health professionals already have a sound understanding of the advantages of bilingualism when they arrive in post. It is only by influencing the content of their initial training and continuing professional development that an appreciation of the advantages of bilingualism will become more deeply embedded in actual practice.

#### **Is it suitable that the Health Sector transmits the Project's message?**

There are arguments both for and against the heavy reliance on health workers for the transmission of the Twf message. Health professionals are respected and enjoy a relationship of trust with parents; their involvement in the promotion of bilingualism thus helps the project to be taken seriously. Because midwives have contact with the mother before the birth, they are in an ideal position to plant the seeds about bilingualism at an early stage. Health visitors take over from midwives shortly after birth. Their ongoing contact with pre-school children in the home and in clinics means that they are well placed to offer support and advice on language development, a situation summed up by a health visitor in a heartland area of North West Wales in the following terms:

Dwi'n teimlo mai ni fel gweithwyr iechyd ydy'r bobl sy'n gweld rhieni ar yr amser iawn - ar gychwyn eu profiad nhw o fod yn rhieni -ac felly ar yr adeg iawn i ddylanwadu arnyn nhw.  
*[I think that we as health workers are the people who see the parents at the right time - at the beginning of their experience of being parents - and so the right period to influence them.]*

It is important to remember, however, that establishing good working relationships with health professionals is often a time-consuming process; that there are many competing, higher priority demands on health workers' time; and that midwives and health visitors transmit the Twf message with varying degrees of enthusiasm and commitment.

Given the influence of this group, it is important that collaboration with health professionals should remain the main focus for the project.

### **Is the Bounty scheme an effective means of transmitting the Project's message?**

The inclusion of the *6 Good Reasons* booklet in Bounty packs offers an excellent opportunity to reach a very large and important audience with minimum effort. Nonetheless, this approach has some limitations. New mothers are tired and preoccupied with more urgent matters; often they take the free gifts and discard any reading material. That said, given the size of the overall print run for this publication, the unit cost is small and inclusion in the Bounty packs thus represents good value for money. Although unlikely to influence parents' decisions on language choice in isolation, this strategy can be seen as a useful element in a multifaceted approach to the promotion of bilingualism.

## Other partners

### **Does the Project work effectively with other organisations in order to reach its strategic aims?**

Although collaboration with health professionals continues to form the core work of Twf, strong links have also been forged with a range of Early Years organizations. Project officers attend Meithrin and Ti a Fi groups, for instance, in order to present the Twf message and talk to individual parents. Initial unease that Twf might be encroaching on the territory of MYM has now been allayed. Representatives from both MYM and Mentrau Iaith commented enthusiastically on their excellent working relationships with the project officers.

They identified three main strengths. First, Twf completes the circle: unlike MYM, they have easy access to antenatal and baby clinics, which means that Twf colleagues are able to promote the work of other Welsh language organizations. Second, Twf provides another voice and helps ease the feeling that 'the same old people are beating the same old drum'. Third, Twf project officers provide additional person power for special events. There was ample evidence of close planning and co-operation between the main Welsh language organizations. The distinctive contribution of Twf, however, was clearly acknowledged. A representative of Flint Menter Iaith, for instance, drew attention to the usefulness of being able to direct callers 'to somebody that specialized in the field of passing language on to children'.

Twf also works with a range of traditionally English-language Early Years organizations, including PPA, SureStart, Home-Start, Bookstart, libraries and Children's Information Bureaux. Representatives of these organizations were generally very positive in interviews, although there was some initial hesitancy in the more Anglicised areas as to whether the Twf message was of immediate relevance for their work and whether collaboration would place additional pressure on an already heavy workload.

In the case of signposting services like the Children's Information Bureaux, contact with project workers mainly takes the form of visits to deliver Twf literature and share information on any new developments. In the case of front line organizations such as SureStart and PPA, collaboration usually takes the form of presentations to parents and the distribution of Twf materials. In the case of Welsh Language organizations such as MYM, partnership takes the form of presentations to parents and collaboration in events.

### **Are there other prospective partners the Project should be working alongside?**

Project officers have begun to talk to groups of NNEB students and NVQ childcare candidates in several FE colleges. Some project workers suggested that work in schools, colleges and leisure centres be expanded in order to influence young people's language choice and, indeed, their choice of language with their own children at a later stage. Since many children who have received a bilingual education

cease to use Welsh socially after leaving school, this is clearly an important area.

Another key area of development is co-operation with the private sector. Many pre-school children spend a considerable proportion of their time in childcare, including commercially run nurseries. Twf has already tentatively explored this in some areas. However, the Welsh Language Board, which has responsibility for political contacts, could usefully develop a triangular relationship with Twf and the National Assembly to explore ways of disseminating information on bilingualism to the private sector, in co-operation, for example, with the Welsh Development Agency.

While expansion into these areas has considerable potential to influence attitudes in the long term, it is important that Twf should carefully prioritise its efforts in order to avoid a situation where project officers are too thinly stretched.

## Summary and conclusions

The Welsh Language Board has demonstrated a sound understanding of the principles and processes of language planning. It has applied this knowledge with considerable effect in initiating a project that targets language transmission in the family. Iaith Cyf., for its part, while remaining faithful to the original spirit of the project, has responded to the realities of fieldwork in imaginative and innovative ways. In particular, it has been able to identify and respond to a range of new challenges.

The aim of this report has been to evaluate the impact, efficiency and effectiveness of the Twf project against its strategic aims.

### **1. Bringing bilingualism into the work of midwives and health visitors**

There is no shortage of evidence that Twf has worked strategically with the health sector, winning the support of directors of midwifery and health visiting services for Health Trusts in the project areas, in order to gain access to individual health visitors and midwives. Measures are now in place to prompt midwives to discuss language choice with women during pregnancy and for health visitors to continue the discussion after birth. The project is also working with Health Professions Wales and the Welsh colleges to ensure that information on bilingualism becomes an integral part of the training of health visitors and midwives. In addition, project workers have forged good working relationships with large numbers of midwives and health visitors in their areas.

### **2. Raising awareness of the advantages of bilingualism**

Again, there was no shortage of evidence that Twf has succeeded in its second strategic aim, raising awareness amongst parents, prospective parents and the public at large of the advantages of bilingualism. In shifting the focus from mixed language families to *all* families, the project has made a virtue of necessity. Its policy of social inclusion has ensured that the Twf message is reaching a far wider audience than might otherwise have been the case. Very large numbers of people have been exposed to information on the benefits of bilingualism through discussions with midwives and health visitors, presentations to antenatal classes and parent groups, a Twf presence at national and local events, and Twf marketing materials. Project officers are also working effectively to provide opportunities for parents to gain confidence in using the language and to promote Welsh language provision for young children and parents through Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin, Mentrau Iaith and Welsh for Adults.

### **3. Changing language patterns**

It is not feasible to measure directly the extent to which the project is achieving the third of the strategic aims: changing the language patterns of the target group, namely mixed language families, in order to increase the number of children speaking Welsh in the home. A wide range of factors influence decisions about language choice and it is impossible to isolate the influence of Twf. There is, however, no shortage of anecdotal evidence that Twf is making a valuable contribution not only to this aim, but also to the broader aim of helping

all families to make an informed choice, irrespective of language background.

The achievements of the first two years of the project are impressive. It will be crucial, however, to closely monitor the plans for further expansion. Project staff are well placed to be able to identify and respond to needs as they arise, but there is a danger that they may be tempted to do too much, too soon, diluting the impact of their efforts in the process. The role of the Welsh Language Board and the steering group in monitoring the project provides a useful counterbalance to this temptation. It is essential that the project managers explain their plans and intentions very clearly to those ultimately responsible for the management of the project; and that members of the steering group take steps to familiarize themselves with the day-to-day work of the project, e.g. by attending occasional regional or national project meetings or shadowing the work of project officers.

The national and international importance of Twf should not be underestimated. While various language minority communities are addressing language transmission in the family in a piecemeal way, the Twf Project represents the first serious attempt to tackle this issue on a strategic level. The Welsh Language Board has specific responsibility for European contacts; it will be important to disseminate the experience of the project to a wider audience of speakers of lesser-used languages.

# Recommendations

## 1. Impact

1.1 Provision should be made for the ongoing evaluation of Twf. This evaluation should be an integral part of the work of the project, rather than a 'bolt-on'. It should involve all stakeholders in the project but special attention should be paid to ways of tracking the impact on parents over time. A selection of parents attending Twf presentations at antenatal classes, for instance, could be interviewed following the presentations and then again at yearly intervals until their children started school. Issues to be explored might include:

- the impact of Twf and other factors on language choice
- exposure to the Twf message at a variety of key points (e.g. at the eight month developmental check by health visitors, at mother and toddler groups and other pre-school provision)
- exposure to the Twf message at local and national events, and through promotional material
- the influence of Twf and other factors on patterns of language use in the family.

The findings of a longitudinal study of this kind would then feed back into Twf policy and practice. They would also intersect with the findings of other research commissioned by the Welsh Language Board.

1.2 Twf workers should be encouraged to continue to explore ways of working in socially inclusive ways in order to reach the widest possible audience. Existing links with organizations that target lower income families should be strengthened; and opportunities for reaching new audiences through activities, such as the McDonalds colouring competitions and family fun evenings, should be pursued wherever practicable.

1.3 A project presence at national events such as the Eisteddfod and the Agricultural Show, as well as local events, is to be encouraged. Sympathetic consideration should be given to the provision of a Play Bus. Given that a considerable amount of time is currently spent transporting materials and setting up stalls at events of this kind, a Play Bus would maximise the efficiency of project staff at the same time as achieving a highly visible presence.

1.4 The lessons already learned in working in more Anglicized areas of North and South West Wales should be applied as the project expands into South East Wales. Given the greater density of population in this new area, however, sympathetic consideration should be given to the higher staffing levels, which will be necessary to achieve a similar impact.

1.5 Twf workers are well placed to identify and respond to needs and should be encouraged to do so. It is important, however, to prioritize aims and objectives so as to ensure that the project effort is not too thinly spread.

1.6 The taster classes for mothers and their young children represent a good example of a sensitive and practical response to perceived needs. While Twf project workers are well placed to deliver this provision, alternative arrangements for the funding of the classes should be explored in conjunction with Welsh for adults and ELWa.

- 1.7 Aims and objectives should be carefully prioritised in order to ensure that the efforts of project staff are not too thinly spread.

## **2. Families**

- 2.1 While mixed-language families should remain an important focus for the project, it should be recognised that families where both parents speak English and families where both parents speak Welsh also benefit from the Twf message. Twf presentations and materials should therefore continue to be sensitive to the needs of *all* families.
- 2.2 The notion of the family needs to be extended to include grandparents, childminders and other carers with whom many children spend a substantial proportion of their time. New ways of targeting these groups should be explored.

## **3. Transmitting the message**

- 3.1 Support for tried and tested marketing materials, such as the *6 Good Reasons booklet* and poster, the *6 Good Questions* leaflet, the Twf newsletter and the CD should be continued. The response to more recent initiatives such as the activity book, the birth form and the t-shirts should be closely monitored; if appropriate, these materials should be more widely disseminated. Most important, Twf staff should be encouraged to develop new materials in response to new needs as they emerge.
- 3.2 Technical issues concerning design and typography set out in Appendix C should be carefully considered in the production of future Twf materials.
- 3.3 The *6 Good Reasons* booklet should continue to be included in Bounty packs as a useful element in a multifaceted approach to the promotion of bilingualism.
- 3.4 The Welsh Language Board should pursue possibilities for commercial sponsorship of marketing projects.
- 3.5 The marketing strategy for Twf should be harmonized with the marketing strategy of the Welsh Language Board in order to ensure maximum impact. It would be useful to explore, for instance, the potential of a television advertising campaign to promote the benefits of bilingualism, in which Twf played a central role. An important first step in this process would be to consult the Basic Skills Agency about lessons learned from the recent TV campaign targeted at adults with low levels of literacy and numeracy.
- 3.6 The Welsh Language Board should take steps to disseminate the experience of this highly innovative and successful project to speakers of other lesser-used languages.

## **4. Structure of the project**

- 4.1 The lack of representation of health professionals on the steering committee should be addressed as a matter of some urgency. Contacts made with Health Professions Wales and the Welsh Colleges represent a useful starting pool of people that might be approached to serve on this committee.

- 4.2 Members of the steering committee should be encouraged to familiarize themselves with the day-to-day work of the project by attending occasional regional or national project meetings or shadowing the work of project staff.
- 4.3 It is essential that the company responsible for fieldwork communicate developments and plans fully and clearly to both the Welsh Language Board and the steering committee.

## **5. Finance**

- 5.1 Given the range of experience of the project workers and the demanding nature of many aspects of their work, rates of pay should be brought more closely in line with those of health professionals and teachers.

## **6. Work with partners**

- 6.1 Collaboration with health professionals should remain the main focus for the project. Priority should continue to be given to work with Health Professions Wales and the Welsh Colleges to ensure that information on bilingualism becomes an integral part of the training of midwives and health visitors.
- 6.2 Steps should be taken to verify that prompts for midwives to discuss language choice with mothers are included when each health authority reprints records of pregnancy.
- 6.3 The current close contact and co-operation with Welsh language organizations such as MYM and Mentrau Iaith should be encouraged and extended. Examples of good practice, such as termly planning meetings with representatives of these organizations, should be embedded in the work of project officers.
- 6.4 The project should capitalize on the interest in Twf message from traditionally English language organizations such as the Pre-school Playgroup Association, Children's Information Bureaux, Bookstart and SureStart.
- 6.5 Many pre-school children spend a large proportion of their time in commercial childcare. The Welsh Language Board, which has responsibility for political contacts, should develop a triangular relationship with Twf and the National Assembly to explore ways of disseminating information on bilingualism to the private sector, in co-operation, for example, with the Welsh Development Agency.

# Appendix A: Fields of interest specified in tender

## 1. Measuring impact

- a) How can the impact of Twf be assessed?
- b) What outcomes from Twf are evident?
- c) What is the geographical spread in impact?

## 2. Families

- a) What evidence exists as to the Project's outcomes in families?
- b) Is there evidence of more families using Welsh as a result of the Twf project?
- c) What types of families are most accessed (e.g. two parents speaking welsh; mixed language families)

## 3. Transmitting the Project's message

- a) Are the means of introducing the Project's message to parents effective?
- b) What forms of marketing would be suitable to transmit the Project's message?
- c) Is there a sufficient and effective range of materials in various media, and are they utilised effectively?

## 4. Structure

- a) Is the current management structure suitable?
- b) Does the current line management structure ensure a full overview of the work, and its quality in particular?

## 5. Finance

- a) Is the current level of funding cost effective?
- b) Are the current salary levels suitable for the Project's officers and do they reflect skills and expertise?

## 6. Partnerships

### *Health Sector*

- a) Are the professional health workers effectively transmitting the Project's message?
- b) What further support or resources is needed by the health sector workers, if at all?
- c) Is it suitable that the Health Sector transmits the Project's message?
- d) Is the Bounty scheme an effective means of transmitting the Project's message?

### *Other partners*

- e) Does the Project work effectively with other organisations in order to reach its strategic aims?
- f) Are there other prospective partners the Project should be working alongside?

## Appendix B: Analysis of data

The table below records the number of examples of each coding category organised by respondent group.

Coding categories	Number of records					
	Health workers	Other partners	Project officers	Parents	Management	Total
advertising	1	1	9	1	9	21
attitude to language	2	10	6			18
bilingualism	11	9	9	6	9	44
Bounty packs	7		6	7	2	22
challenges SE Wales			5		2	7
child minding			1	4	3	8
conditions of service	1		10	1	14	26
Parents' Confidence	3	5	7	7		22
events	6	5	8	5	5	29
family types	24	21	6	15	5	71
finance			9		14	23
geographical variation	16	8	24	7	5	60
health worker management support	4				1	5
health worker pressure	11		9		1	21
impact on language choice	10	4	3	8	4	29
outcome	8	11	32	6	8	65
in-migrants	15	1	9		1	26
initial impact	15	4	1	12		32
initial contact	16	2	2	8		28
language restoration			7			7
large geographical area			7			7
learners	5	2	4	7		18
long term plans	7	6	4		8	25
management structure					9	9
management support			11		4	15
materials	50	18	39	18	10	135
newsletter	7	15	1	7	4	34

older children		1	9		1	11
other partners	2	16	26		7	51
part-time workers	1	1	9	1	3	15
personal experience	6	5	11	1		23
project worker qualities	2	5	5	2	3	17
recent developments	1		7		7	15
role of health workers	25	1	37	11	6	80
sceptics	10	1	7	1	1	20
social class	5	5	3		2	15
specialist help	5	1	1	1		8
suggestions	18	3	5	5	2	56
taster classes	1	3	5	1	2	12
team work		11	8		3	22
training			3		5	8
transmitting the message	14	6	25	7	4	56
Welsh classes for parents	3	6	2	2		13
Welsh speakers diffidence to use	7	9	11		5	32
work with parents		5	1			6

## Organization of analytical categories

The structural plan below shows the ways in which the coding categories were mapped on to the questions, which the evaluation has sought to answer:

1. Impact
  - initial impact
  - on language choice
  - attitude to language
    - bilingualism
    - confidence
    - language restoration
  - sceptics
  - outcome
    - social class
    - events
      - taster classes
      - Welsh classes for parents
      - Welsh speakers diffidence to use work with parents
  - geographical variation
    - large geographical area
    - challenges SE
2. Families
  - family types
  - in-migrants
  - childminding
  - older children
3. Structure
  - management structure
  - management support
    - Project workers
    - conditions of service
    - part-time workers
    - personal experience
    - qualities project workers
    - team work
    - training
  - finance
3. Transmitting the message
  - materials
    - newsletter
    - Bounty packs
  - advertising
4. Health workers
  - role of health workers
  - health worker management support
  - health worker pressure
5. Looking to the future
  - Recent developments
  - Long term plans
  - Suggestions

## Example report: health worker pressure

The report below, generated by the software package HyperResearch, relates to the coding category 'health worker pressure'. It sets out:

- the project name (Twf), coding category (health worker pressure), and number of records (e.g. 21)
- a text reference number (e.g. 4104,4140 )and the name of the individual or interview which generated the source material (e.g. Denbigh midwives, project officers Aberaeron)
- the source material.

Twf health worker pressure 21  
TEXT 4104,4140 Denbigh midwives.txt  
Source Material:  
I suppose time consuming is the word.

Twf health worker pressure 21  
TEXT 7231,7549 Denbigh midwives.txt  
Source Material:  
Glynwen: If I have time to put a six week course in. I haven't always. Sometimes it just so happens that there's more due in three weeks then I have to squash things up and I have to do my bare minimum, in which is antenatal labour and a tour. But if I can get a good six week course, yeah I will keep a spot for XXX.

Twf health worker pressure 21  
TEXT 11449,11500 ProjectOfficersaberaeron.  
Source Material:  
G: Their pressure of work K: Yes, pressure of work.

Twf health worker pressure 21  
TEXT 11795,11874 ProjectOfficersaberaeron.txt  
Source Material:  
R: We depend on their good will to share extra information in a restricted time.

Twf health worker pressure 21  
TEXT 1176,1740 Bethan.txt  
Source Material:  
We met last Friday and we have been discussing the difficulty we have in getting people from the health sector because of time commitments. We do actually have in theory another member, but who didn't attend. She's a health visitor but she doesn't attend. So what we have decided is that we might call on members from the health sector maybe to attend a certain meeting. So we are going to have themed steering group meetings maybe dealing with a specific issue. It's easier then to get some experts involved for one-off meetings. They are held at least quarterly.

Twf health worker pressure 21  
TEXT 10481,10588 AsaphProjectOfficers.txt  
Source Material:  
Mae gyda nhw ddigon o bethau eraill ar eu platiau hefyd. Ie, dyna'r un peth yn de gyda gweithwyr iechyd

Twf health worker pressure 21  
TEXT 33332,33408 AsaphProjectOfficers.txt  
Source Material:  
Fel oeddwn i'n dweud yn gynharach, dydyn nhw ddim yn gweld e'n flaenoriaeth.

Twf health worker pressure 21

TEXT 33879,34359 AsaphProjectOfficers.txt

Source Material:

Mae rhaid i ni fod yn sensitif o'i gwaith nhw. Mae gynnon nhw bwysau gwaith, mae 'na rywun dragwyddol yn gofyn iddyn nhw i rannu gwybodaeth "Wnewch chi rhoi hwn?" - deintydd, llau pen, mae rhywbeth yn wythnosol yn wahanol yn dod ar 'i rhan nhw. Mae rhaid i rhywun fod yn ymwybodol o hynny. Mae'i gwaith, mae pressure ar ei gwaith nhw hefyd, mae lot ohonyn nhw dim ond yn gweithio rhan amser ac mae lot ohonyn nhw am fod rhai yn mynd ar gyfnod mamolaeth, mae rhai yn cyfro yr ardal.

Twf health worker pressure 21

TEXT 34406,34634 AsaphProjectOfficers.txt

Source Material:

Dwi wedi cael rhai yn dwad yn Dolgellau sydd yno ers blwyddyn a hanner dwi'n siwr, mae wedi mynd. Roedd hi'n ddi-Gymraeg ond roedd hi wedi gorfod cyfro ardal Bala hefyd a gwneud Dolgellau, mae gynnon nhw'i pwysau gwaith i hunan.

Twf health worker pressure 21

TEXT 38388,38930 AsaphProjectOfficers.txt

Source Material:

Ae'r cyfnod ar ol cael y plentyn yn unig iawn mae'n rhaid, wrth gwrs mae nhw wedyn yn gwerthfawrogi'r cysylltiad, dyna di'r broblem, mae gen y gweithwyr iechyd gymaint o bethau i'w drafod, gymaint o wybodaeth i roid drosodd i'r riant dyw testun iaith a dwyieithrwydd ddim ond yn rywbeth bach yng nghanol y pictiwr mawr. Ac wedyn dwi'n siwr gyda rhai teuluoedd, dydyn nhw ddim yn cael amser falle, os oes problemau, os ydy'r plentyn yn wael, neu fod 'na broblemau hefo beichiogrwydd, problemau cymdeithasol, dyna lle da chi mynd i syrthio lawr.

Twf health worker pressure 21

TEXT 3313,4001 Cyfweliad Ymwelwyr IechydMancotDeeside.txt

Source Material:

I must admit that my first reaction was 'Not another scheme', because in our job it seems that we carry out various schemes for various other agencies, and that the issues that the parent might bring to the 8 month assessment clinic can be buried under all the information that we have to give out to them. So I admit that it did cause me some concern, but I went along with it, and I could understand that it was a good idea. I didn't know how it would be received, but it has worked out. If parents come with feeding difficulties, that's obviously what we have to spend the time talking about. We have a time constraint on our time with them, and it does pressurise the time a little.

Twf health worker pressure 21

TEXT 4044,4507 Cyfweliad Ymwelwyr IechydMancotDeeside.txt

Source Material:

I would agree with Gina that at the 8 month check there is an awful lot of information to convey to parents, and they might come with other problems. But it is also the time when they might start thinking about things like toddler groups, and looking about locally for groups that are available; so it is, I suppose, a useful time to give it, because the next formal check we have is at 2 years, and by that time, some children are already attending some groups.

Twf health worker pressure 21

TEXT 5045,5554 Cyfweliad Ymwelwyr IechydMancotDeeside.txt

Source Material:

I have mixed feelings about it really. Because, as you see, I'm not a Welsh speaker, but I can see value in it and the reasons behind it. I must admit that on some occasions I haven't given it the priority that perhaps it deserves. Because there are issues, more pressing issues, that the parents bring with them. We're also giving out books as part of the Bookstart scheme, and these things are done at the end of the assessments, and if we are pressed for time, then perhaps it doesn't get much attention.

Twf health worker pressure 21

TEXT 11630,11958 Cyfweiliad Ymwelwyr IechydMancotDeeside.txt

Source Material:

If we've got enough staff - and we're almost never in that position - to sort of chat at length about these issues before we do the tests ... we have to address health and safety issues and post-natal depression and that kind of thing, if we had enough nursery nurses for it to work that way, but in reality that is not the case.

Twf health worker pressure 21

TEXT 21822,22056 Cyfweiliad Ymwelwyr IechydMancotDeeside.txt

Source Material:

And when Eirian wasn't here, we used to have to get a health visitor from Rhos to come all the way, Rhiannon. So as a team, they recognise that you need a Welsh speaker as one of your number. Gina: Yes - they're just few and far between.

Twf health worker pressure 21

TEXT 27674,28006 Cyfweiliad Ymwelwyr IechydMancotDeeside.txt

Source Material:

I think our main constraint is time, isn't it? The Bookstart scheme, when that started, was very time-consuming, and generated a lot of paperwork, whereas this, in carrying it out, is fairly quick. Yes, you do have more of a conversation with some families that with others, but in general, it doesn't take up a great deal of time.

Twf health worker pressure 21

TEXT 3939,4137 DolgellaucyfweiliadymwelwyrIechyd2.txt

Source Material:

Ond roedd na Ymwelydd Iechyd yn Nolgellau oedd yn Saesneg ei hiaith, ac roedd hi'n teimlo ei bod yn rhy brysur i orfod cymryd at y peth... (t,p yn aneglur iawn)

Twf health worker pressure 21

TEXT 10855,10935 DolgellaucyfweiliadymwelwyrIechyd2.txt

Source Material:

Does gan ymwelwyr iechyd ddim digon o amser i drafod y peth mewn unrhyw ddyfnder.

Twf health worker pressure 21

TEXT 13257,13340 DolgellaucyfweiliadymwelwyrIechyd2.txt

Source Material:

Dydy pob ymwelydd iechyd ddim yn ei roi yn y nodiadau - yn ei weld fel 'extra work'.

Twf health worker pressure 21

TEXT 31470,31587 Aberaeronswyddogionprosiectrhiannon.txt

Source Material:

Chris: Achos mae shwt gymaint o waith da nhw i'w wneud, a bod yn deg da nhw - ond rydwi wedi cael siom ar yr ochr ore.

Twf health worker pressure 21

TEXT 46242,46553 Llanelwyswyddogionprosiectrhiannon.txt

Source Material:

Mai iechyd y fam a'r plentyn ydy'r pethau pwysicaf, ac mae iaith yn dod yn isel iawn. XXX Rydyn ni'n parchu hynny o'r cychwyn, ac yn sylweddoli lle mae rhannu neges Twf o fewn eu rhestr blaenoriaethau nhw. Ond ar yr un pryd, rydyn ni'n gobeithio eu bod nhw'n gallu cydweithio hefo ni mewn ffordd broffesiynol.

## Appendix C: Review of Twf promotional materials

Professor Sue Walker

The aim of this report is to review the typographic and graphic presentation of information in promotional materials produced by Twf. It is based on observation of six items of Twf material:

- a poster *6 good reasons for making sure your children can speak Welsh*
- a leaflet *6 good questions*
- a small-format booklet *6 good reasons*
- three copies of the newsletter *Twf*
- CD-cover *Twf songs*
- a colouring book
- a birth form.

The report is divided into the following sections: general overview / graphic 'feel', use of illustrations, use of typography, treatment of bilingual text

### General overview / graphic 'feel'

There is a *clear and strong brand identity* achieved by:

- the use of yellow and purple on four of the documents surveyed
- a clear and identifiable logo comprising hands, the word 'Twf' and the strapline 'Raising children bilingually' in Welsh and in English
- application of the above through all the documents reviewed (apart from the colouring book)
- use of identifiable cartoon characters throughout the material
- the sub-theme '6' to link the poster, leaflet and small booklet.

The material appears *friendly and welcoming* achieved by:

- informal language ('Give your children the best start. They'll thank you for it. '; and the lively, chatty headings in the newsletter)
- a question and answer format in the leaflet
- informal lettering such as that used for the word 'Twf' and the strap line in the logo
- cartoon illustrations (smiley, happy faces).

The material gives the impression of being grounded in reality, of having a genuine *awareness of the needs of the communities it serves* through

- use of family case studies and stories of celebrities in the newsletter
- use of ordinary, snapshot-like photographs (rather than highly-polished professional ones) in the newsletter
- publicity material, such as the colouring book, birth form, and CD of songs, that will be used by families.

The organisation comes across as being *authoritative*:

- the materials appear professionally presented
- there is clear and appropriate acknowledgement of the sponsoring organisations (Welsh Assembly and Welsh Language Board).

### Use of illustrations

*The use of photographs and cartoons is good.*

- There are two styles of illustration used in the materials: photographs and cartoons. Photographs are used in the newsletter. This is an appropriate use and the different ways of treating them, sometimes squared up and sometimes cut out, makes sure that the pages have a lively feel. However, care should be taken with cropping to make sure that the final image is well balanced (the picture of the toddler blowing out a candle on the third page of first newsletter is an example of a badly cropped picture).
- The cartoon characters are clearly identifiable and they add an informal, friendly quality to the materials.
- The cartoons work least well on the poster probably because they are surrounded by a circular yellow border. This treatment emphasises the faces at the expense of the activity they are engaged in, and it is the activity that has more relevance to the phrases that are associated with the circles. The picture next to 'In the family' for example, does not immediately remind us of family life.

### **Use of typography and lettering**

*The typography is generally good, and the type is legible and accessible.*

Sans serif types are used for the bulk of the text in the leaflet, newsletter and small booklet, and is an appropriate choice:

- it works well with the informal and script types used for headings
- it reflects the informality of the language in the leaflet.

Scripts and more informal types are used for headings and phrases. They work well

- to give an informal, friendly feel to the materials. A good example of this use is in the leaflet where a script typeface is used for the questions that act as headings.
- to make a link with the Twf logo (as on the CD-cover).

There are *a few areas where the typography could be improved:*

- the type in the newsletter, though given generous space between the lines, is very small, and may be difficult for people to read (especially grandparents). This is particularly the case with the longer line lengths.
- care should be taken with spacing to make sure that headings relate to the text that follows, and that different kinds of information are separated out. The structure of the leaflet is a little difficult to follow because not enough attention has been paid to the use of space.
- The newsletter could perhaps benefit from the use of a different typeface, perhaps a serif, to help differentiate some of the stories. More typographic variety in the headings would also help to liven the publication.

The logo, comprising the hands, the word Twf and the phrases is *an excellent concept, but there is room for improvement in its graphic presentation:*

- the letters used for Twf are rather ugly and would benefit from being re-drawn
- there are two slightly different representations. The 'w' and the 'f' touch in the version on the newsletter, but not on the versions used on the poster and leaflet, for example.

## Treatment of bilingual text

The materials under review show that *attention has been given to making sure that neither Welsh nor English is made more prominent than the other.*

The Welsh text appears first in all the materials under review, which is appropriate. Apart from that, the languages are generally given equal status through their typographic presentation.

However, consideration needs to be given to the use of colours on dark backgrounds such as purple (one of the colours chosen to identify Twf). Whenever white is used for lettering on this background colour it has the most emphasis. Thus, the English text appears marginally more dominant than the Welsh on the poster, whereas on the masthead of the newsletter, the Welsh is graphically stronger.

The leaflet *6 good questions* is an excellent bilingual presentation: one side of the leaflet contains the Welsh text, the other the English. Moreover, the texts are not direct translations, the Welsh is written with reference to issues that Welsh-speaking families may wish to consider, and the English with English-speaking families in mind.